

ENERGY CONDITIONS AND GALAXY FORMATION

MATT VISSER

*Physics Department, Washington University,
Saint Louis, Missouri 63130-4899, USA*

The energy conditions of Einstein gravity are designed to extract as much information as possible from classical general relativity without specifying a particular equation of state. This is particularly useful in a cosmological setting, where the equation of state for the cosmological fluid is extremely uncertain. The *strong energy condition* (SEC) provides a simple and robust bound on the behaviour of the look-back time as a function of red-shift. Observation suggests that the SEC may be violated sometime between the epoch of galaxy formation and the present.

1 Introduction

The energy conditions of Einstein gravity are designed to side-step, as much as possible, the need to pin down a particular equation of state. Observation seems to indicate that the SEC is violated rather late in the life of the universe—somewhere between galaxy formation and the present time, in an epoch where the cosmological temperature never exceeds 60 Kelvin.^{1,2} I show this by using the SEC to develop a simple and robust bound for the look-back time as a function of red-shift in Friedmann–Robertson–Walker (FRW) cosmologies. The experimental observations I need are the present day value of the Hubble parameter H_0 , an age estimate for the age of the oldest stars in the galactic halo, and an estimate for the red-shift at which these oldest stars formed. From the theoretical side, I only need to use a FRW cosmology subject to the Einstein equations and SEC, and nothing more.

2 SEC in a FRW Universe

The standard FRW cosmology is described by the metric

$$ds^2 = -dt^2 + a(t)^2 \left[\frac{dr^2}{1 - kr^2} + r^2(d\theta^2 + \sin^2 \theta d\phi^2) \right]. \quad (1)$$

with $k = -1, 0, +1$. The Einstein equations are

$$\rho = \frac{3}{8\pi G} \left[\frac{\dot{a}^2}{a^2} + \frac{k}{a^2} \right]; \quad p = -\frac{1}{8\pi G} \left[2\frac{\ddot{a}}{a} + \frac{\dot{a}^2}{a^2} + \frac{k}{a^2} \right]. \quad (2)$$

For the case of a FRW spacetime the SEC specializes to

$$\text{SEC} \iff (\rho + 3p \geq 0) \text{ and } (\rho + p \geq 0). \quad (3)$$

Consider the quantity

$$\rho + 3p = -\frac{3}{4\pi G} \left[\frac{\ddot{a}}{a} \right]. \quad (4)$$

Thus

$$\text{SEC} \Rightarrow \quad \ddot{a} < 0. \quad (5)$$

The SEC implies that the expansion of the universe is decelerating—and this conclusion holds independent of whether the universe is open, flat, or closed.

3 Look-back time

The look-back time, $\tau = |t - t_0|$, is the difference between the age of the universe when a particular light ray was emitted and the age of the universe now.

$$\tau(a; a_0) = |t - t_0| = \int_a^{a_0} \frac{da}{\dot{a}(a)}. \quad (6)$$

By putting a lower bound on $\dot{a}$ we deduce an upper bound on look-back time. Since the SEC implies that the expansion is decelerating, we see

$$\text{SEC} \Rightarrow \quad \tau(a; a_0) = |t - t_0| \leq \frac{1}{H_0} \frac{a_0 - a}{a_0} = \frac{1}{H_0} \frac{z}{1 + z}. \quad (7)$$

This provides us with a robust upper bound on the Hubble parameter

$$\text{SEC} \Rightarrow \quad \forall z : H_0 \leq \frac{1}{\tau(z)} \frac{z}{1 + z}. \quad (8)$$

This is enough to illustrate the “age-of-the-universe” problem. Suppose we have some class of standard candles whose age of formation, τ_f , we can by some means estimate. Suppose further that we look out far enough can see some of these standard candles forming at red-shift z_f . Then

$$\text{SEC} \Rightarrow \quad H_0 \leq \frac{1}{\tau_f} \frac{z_f}{1 + z_f}. \quad (9)$$

4 Observations

The standard candles most of interest are the globular clusters in the halos of spiral galaxies: stellar evolution models lead to the estimate³ that the age of oldest stars is $16 \pm 2 \times 10^9$ yr. The oldest stars seem to be forming somewhat earlier than the development of galactic spiral structure ($z_f \approx 15$).³ This bounds the Hubble parameter^{1,2}

$$\text{SEC} \Rightarrow \quad H_0 \leq 58 \pm 7 \text{ km s}^{-1} \text{ Mpc}^{-1}. \quad (10)$$

Recent estimates of the present day value of the Hubble parameter are⁴

$$H_0 \in (65, 85) \text{ km s}^{-1} \text{ Mpc}^{-1}. \quad (11)$$

But even the lowest reasonable value for the Hubble parameter is only just barely compatible with the SEC, and that only by taking the lowest reasonable value for the age of the globular clusters. For currently favored values of the Hubble

parameter we deduce that the SEC is violated somewhere between the formation of the oldest stars and the present time.^{1,2} (*Warning: observational estimates of these quantities are changing rapidly as this is being written.*) If we reduce z_f to be more in line with the formation of the rest of the galactic structure (say $z_f \approx 7$) we make the problem worse, not better ($H_0 \leq 54 \pm 7 \text{ km s}^{-1} \text{ Mpc}^{-1}$). This difficulty is occurring at low cosmological temperatures ($T \leq 60 \text{ K}$), and late times, in a region where we thought we understood the basic equation of state of the cosmological fluid.

5 SEC violations—Implications

The two favorite ways of putting SEC violations into a classical field theory are via a massive scalar field, or via a positive cosmological constant.

A classical scalar field violates the SEC, but not the other energy conditions. It is this violation of the SEC that makes cosmological scalar fields so attractive to advocates of inflation. Using a massive scalar field to deal with the age-of-the-universe problem is tantamount to asserting that a last dying gasp of inflation took place as the galaxies were being formed. This would be extremely surprising.^{1,2}

In contrast, the current favorite fix for the age-of-the-universe problem is to introduce a positive cosmological constant. Under the mild constraint that the pressure due to normal matter in the present epoch be non-negative, a SEC violation would require that more than 33% of the present-day energy density is due to a cosmological constant—and we do not need to know the equation of state of the normal component of matter to extract this result.^{1,2}

6 Discussion

This analysis of the age-of-the-universe problem is, as far as possible, model independent. I have shown that high values of the Hubble parameter imply that the SEC must be violated sometime between the epoch of galaxy formation and the present. This implies that the age-of-the-universe problem cannot simply be fixed by adjusting the equation of state of the cosmological fluid. Since all normal matter satisfies the SEC, fixing the age-of-universe problem will inescapably require the introduction of “*abnormal*” matter—indeed we will need large quantities of abnormal matter, sufficient to overwhelm the gravitational effects of the normal matter.

Acknowledgments

This research was supported by the U.S. Department of Energy.

References

1. M. Visser, *Science* **276**, 88 (1997).
2. M. Visser, *Phys. Rev. D* **56**, (1997), in press, gr-qc/9705070.
3. P.J.E. Peebles, *Principles of Physical Cosmology*, (Princeton University Press, 1993).

4. Particle Data Group, *Phys. Rev. D* **54** 1, (1996).